

April 21, 2004

Court File No. 03-CV-253768-CM3

ONTARIO
SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE

BETWEEN:

CHIPPEWAS OF SAUGEEEN FIRST NATION

Plaintiffs

- AND -

THE CORPORATION OF THE TOWNSHIP OF AMABEL,
HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN IN RIGHT OF ONTARIO,
THE ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ONTARIO,
HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN IN RIGHT OF CANADA,
THE ATTORNEY GENERAL OF CANADA, BARBARA TWINING,
LARRY TWINING, DAVID DOBSON, ALBERTA LEMON,
SAUBLE BEACH DEVELOPMENTS CORPORATION,
ESTATE OF WILLIAM ELDRIDGE, AND ESTATE OF
CHARLES ALBERT RICHARDS

Defendants

**STATEMENT OF DEFENCE, COUNTERCLAIM AND CROSSCLAIM
OF THE CORPORATION OF THE TOWNSHIP OF AMABEL
(NOW REFERRED TO AS THE MUNICIPALITY OF SOUTH BRUCE PENINSULA)
HEREINAFTER REFERRED TO AS "AMABEL".**

STATEMENT OF DEFENCE

1. The Defendant, the Corporation of the Township of Amabel (hereinafter "Amabel") except as hereinafter specifically admitted denies each and every allegations contained in the Statement of Claim and puts the Plaintiff to the strict proof thereof.

2. The Defendant Amabel admits the allegations contained in paragraph 3 and 9 of the statement of claim in this action.
3. The Defendant Amabel has no knowledge of the allegations contained in paragraphs 4, 6, 7, 8 and 10 of the Plaintiffs statement of claim.
4. The Defendant Amabel says as a fact and the fact is that some of the lands described in Paragraph 5 of the Statement of Claim are privately owned and the title to these lands were conveyed by way of Crown patent. The Defendant Amabel does not have full particulars of these crown patents at the date of the delivery of this Statement of Defence.
5. Amabel denies the allegations contained in paragraphs 11, 12 and 13 of the Statement of Claim in this action and puts the Plaintiffs to the strict proof thereof.
6. If the plaintiffs suffered damages, costs and expenses as alleged in paragraphs 11 and 13 of the statement of claim in this action, which is denied, the damages, costs and expenses were occasioned by the fault of the plaintiffs, were and are too remote for recovery, and were not the subject of reasonable or any steps by the plaintiffs to avoid or mitigate them. There can be no recovery in respect of such alleged damages, costs and expenses even if suffered and even if liability for them exists, both of which are denied. In the alternative, any recovery must be reduced by the degree of fault of the plaintiffs. Amabel pleads and relies upon the Negligence Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. N.1, s. 3 and its predecessors.
7. The Defendant Amabel adopts the allegations contained in the statement of defence of Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Ontario and The Attorney General of Ontario contained in Paragraphs 9 to 65 inclusive.

8. The Defendant Amabel adopts the allegations contained in the Statement of Defence filed by the Defendant Amabel in Action No. 44874/90 against Amabel commenced on January 18, 1990 by the Attorney General of Canada.
9. The Defendant Amabel therefore asks that this action as against it be dismissed with costs.

COUNTERCLAIM

10. The Defendant, Amabel, the Plaintiff by counterclaim, repeats the allegations contained in it's Statement of Defence as delivered herein.
11. The Plaintiff by counterclaim , pleads that as a result of the facts alleged in its Statement of Defence, it is entitled to a declaration that the lands and premises referred to in the statement of Claim are the property of the persons who have Crown Patents or in the alternative the property of the Plaintiff by counterclaim and persons who have Crown Patents to the said lands.
12. In the alternative, the Plaintiff by counterclaim states that t as a result of the facts alleged in the statement of Defence, it is entitled to a declaration that the settlers in the vicinity, the inhabitants of the Township of Amabel, visitors, the public at large and individual members of the public are entitled to continue to use, occupy and enjoy the lands and properties claimed by the Plaintiff in this action, in the same manner as heretofore.
13. The Plaintiff by counterclaim therefore claims:
 - a) a declaration that the lands and premises referred to in the Statement of Claim are the property of the persons who have Crown Patents or in the alternative the property of the Plaintiff by counterclaim and persons who have Crown Patents to the said lands;

- b) in the alternative, a declaration that the settlers in the vicinity, the inhabitants of the Township of Amabel, visitors, and the public at large are entitled as of right to continue to use, occupy and to enjoy the lands and property claimed by the Plaintiff in this action, in the same manner as heretofore;
- c) it's costs of this counterclaim;
- d) such further and other relief as may seem just.

CROSSCLAIM

- 14. The Defendant Amabel claims against the Defendants Her Majesty the Queen in right of Canada and The Attorney General of Canada (hereinafter "Canada");
 - a) an order that any and all relief and costs to which this Court may find the plaintiffs entitled in the action is relief and costs against Canada only, or in the alternative, an order directing Canada to indemnify Amabel in the amount of any relief and costs for which this Court finds Amabel liable to the plaintiffs; and
 - b) costs.
- 15. Amabel repeats and relies upon, in the crossclaim, the contents of the statement of defence of Amabel.
- 16. Any liability to the plaintiffs in the action, which is denied, is therefore a liability of Canada and not a liability of Amabel.

17. Canada is therefore liable to Amabel for all or any part of the plaintiffs' claim for which the Court may find Amabel liable.

April 21, 2004

DONNELLY & MURPHY
Barristers and Solicitors
18 The Square
Goderich, Ontario
N7A 3Y7
Daniel J. Murphy, Q.C.
Tel. (519) 524-2154
Fax. (519) 524-8550
Solicitors for the defendant, The
Corporation of the Township of Amabel.

TO: Ministry of the Attorney General
Crown Law Office, Civil
720 Bay Street
8th Floor
Toronto, Ontario
M5G 2K1

Robert Ratcliffe
Tel: (416) 326-4128

Richard Coutinho
Tel: (416) 314-4569
Fax: (416) 326-4181

Solicitor for the defendants Her Majesty the Queen
in right of Ontario and The Attorney General of
Ontario and the plaintiff by counterclaim The
Attorney General of Ontario

AND TO: DEREK GROUND
Barrister and Solicitor
296 Durie Street
Toronto, Ontario
M6S 3G3
(416) 604-3434
(416) 604-3596
Solicitor for the Plaintiffs

AND TO: THE DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL OF CANADA
Department of Justice Canada
Ontario Regional Office
The Exchange Tower
130 King Street West
Suite 3400, Box 36
Toronto, Ontario
M5X 1K6
Attention: Gary Penner

Tel: (416) 973-9268
Fax: (416) 973-2319
Solicitor for the defendants Her Majesty
The Queen in right of Canada and
The Attorney General of Canada

AND TO: GREENFIELD & BARRIE
Barristers and Solicitors
152 Tenth Street West
Owen Sound, Ontario
N4K 5R4

Attention: Brian Barrie
Tel: (519) 376-4930
Fax: (519) 376-4010
Solicitor for the defendants Barbara
Twining, Larry Twining, David Dobson and
Alberta Lemon

AND TO: THOMAS BASCIANO
Barrister and Solicitor
115 Hughson Street North
Hamilton, Ontario
L8R 1G7

Tel: (905) 525-4396
Fax: (905) 525-4396
Solicitor for the defendant Sauble Beach
Development Corporation